‘The Devil Who Heals’: Fraud and Falsification in the Evangelical Career of John G Lake, Missionary to South Africa 1908-1913

Barry Morton

Ivy Tech Community College, University of South Africa, USA

To cite this article: Barry Morton (2012): ‘The Devil Who Heals’: Fraud and Falsification in the Evangelical Career of John G Lake, Missionary to South Africa 1908-1913, African Historical Review, 44:2, 98-118

To link to this article: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/17532523.2012.739752

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

Full terms and conditions of use: http://www.tandfonline.com/page/terms-and-conditions

This article may be used for research, teaching, and private study purposes. Any substantial or systematic reproduction, redistribution, reselling, loan, sub-licensing, systematic supply, or distribution in any form to anyone is expressly forbidden.

The publisher does not give any warranty express or implied or make any representation that the contents will be complete or accurate or up to date. The accuracy of any instructions, formulae, and drug doses should be independently verified with primary sources. The publisher shall not be liable for any loss, actions, claims, proceedings, demand, or costs or damages whatsoever or howsoever caused arising directly or indirectly in connection with or arising out of the use of this material.
‘The Devil Who Heals’: Fraud and Falsification in the Evangelical Career of John G Lake, Missionary to South Africa 1908–1913

Barry Morton
Ivy Tech Community College, USA; University of South Africa

ABSTRACT
An analysis of the missionary career of John G Lake shows that the initial spread of Pentecostalism and Zionism in southern Africa was facilitated by the systematic use of fraud and deception. After having fled from Zion City in America in 1907 to escape popular justice, Lake and his missionary party introduced to South Africa an array of faith healing techniques used by the original Zionist John Alexander Dowie. They used these and other forms of deception to build a unified Zionist/Pentecostal movement. Additionally, they trained a number of influential African Zionists to use these methods – a factor that further contributed to the rapid spread of this new religious movement.

Keywords: John G Lake, South Africa, Pentecostalism, Zionism, faith healing, missions

The American evangelist John G Lake (1870-1935) was a major player in the early development of both Zionism and Pentecostalism in South Africa. His 1908–13 mission introduced both the speaking of tongues (glossolalia) in South Africa as well as the use of ‘Faith Healing’ practices in worship services. He was also the organizer and leader of the Apostolic Faith Mission (AFM), which successfully incorporated most of South Africa’s Zionists and Pentecostals under a single umbrella. Simply put, Lake was instrumental in spreading this fusion of Zionism/Pentecostalism that is unique to southern Africa. If we are to accept rough estimates of the current size of the offspring of this movement, then around half of southern African Christians today are adherents of it.\(^1\) Beyond any doubt, Lake played a decisive role in the spreading of this ‘second evangelization’.\(^2\)

Historical scholarship on Lake and also the Zionist/Pentecostal movement has been relatively scarce, despite the fact that it was by far the most successful southern African religious movement of the twentieth century. Much of the writing on the Zionists (such as the classic works by Sundkler\(^3\)) has been sociological/anthropological in nature. In recent

years a biography and other scholarship produced by scholars writing from a Pentecostal or Evangelical perspective have been fairly thorough in explicating the development of Zionist ritual and theology, as well as the diffusion of the movement from its early centers on the Rand and the Highveld. This paper will not replicate this material, but instead will focus on a far more sinister side of the ‘second evangelization’. To date, the Zionist enterprise has largely been treated with kid gloves by academics. Secular observers such as Jean Comaroff have been influential in labeling the Zionists as a ‘resistance’ movement, ‘a dissenting discourse’ that enabled southern Africans to mitigate the sufferings imposed by capitalism, colonialism, and apartheid. Religious writers have tended to view the spread of Zionism as divinely inspired, and have sometimes gone so far as to assert that various Zionist leaders were directly sent by God to southern Africa. Once there, they are credited with having orchestrated massive healing campaigns using nothing but the laying of hands to cure disease and infirmity of all kinds, to raise the dead, and to perform miracles of all kinds. Thus, as Landau has noted about Zionist and other ‘African-Initiated Churches’ (AICs): ‘Both secular and academic scholarship tend to judge AICs as innately positive developments. AICs are seen in elevated terms, as symbolical theaters or places to perform wellness, and as centers for social networks.’

All this writing on Lake and the early Zionists has not, however, taken up the way in which the movement was actually first organised and disseminated. John G. Lake was, simply put, a fraud (or ‘con man’ or ‘false prophet’, depending on one’s outlook) throughout his entire career, a preacher who consciously used deception both to gain tithe-paying adherents, and to defraud and control them once they were in his organization. In his later, post-South Africa career, for instance, Lake was arrested both for peddling worthless securities to members of his Oregon congregations, and also for impersonating both

police officers and a ‘Mohammedan’ mind-cure healer named ‘Abdul Ben Shinandar’. Although Lake claimed to be able to use ‘Divine Healing’ to cure all manner of disease and disability, at times his ‘cures’ were also exposed as frauds in the American press.\(^{10}\) In the literature on South African Pentecostalism and Zionism these unsettling sides of Lake’s personality, often reported in the press in his day, have simply been ignored.\(^{11}\) Nor has anyone examined whom he trained and influenced in these arts, even though he was closely associated with some of the most influential Zionist leaders in South Africa. What this paper will argue is that Lake learned the religious con in John Alexander Dowie’s original Zionist church in the decade prior to his South African mission.\(^{12}\) When these activities are placed alongside the fictitious religious persona that he crafted for himself, it becomes clear that he was involved in an array of deceptions before, during, and after his South African mission. Whether Lake actually believed in the religious messages that he propagated is impossible to tell. This was a question that also baffled John Dowie’s detractors during the latter’s lifetime.\(^{13}\) Even in the event that Lake was a fervent Pentecostal at heart, nevertheless conscious deception lay at the center of the religious activities of which he took charge.

Lake’s activities at the time he led the Zionist/Pentecostal movement seriously call into question the characterization of the movement as ‘resistance’ to colonialism, while also making a mockery of its allegedly divine inspiration. But before any revision of the nature of the Zionists can be attempted, it is necessary to lay out in considerable detail the nature of Lake’s schemes – schemes that influential Zionists such as Edward Lion and Isaiah Shembe would utilize to build up their own followings.

THE ‘MIRACULOUS’ JOURNEY OF THE LAKE PARTY TO SOUTH AFRICA EXAMINED

There is no better way to get a taste for Lake’s effrontery than to examine the narratives of his party’s journey from Indianapolis to South Africa in 1908. Although the events attending Lake’s journey have frequently been cited as evidence of divine support for the arrival of the Pentecost in Africa, we can in fact draw a more sinister conclusion – that fraud and misrepresentation were central to the early spread of Zionism and Pentecostalism in South Africa.

10. The iconoclastic websites http://www.letusreason.org/Popteach45.htm (viewed October 2011) and http://endtimespropheticwords.wordpress.com/category/curry-blake/ (viewed Nov 1911) list a range of frauds he committed in the American northwest following his return from South Africa.
11. See especially Burpeau, God’s Showman, 162-6, 169-75, 184-5.
In late 1907, Lake, Tom Hezmalhalch, and J.O. Lehman, all supposedly endowed with the gift of tongues, emerged as the unofficial leaders of the fledgling Indianapolis Pentecostal community. All were new arrivals in the city, each using the peripatetic and fluid nature of the early Pentecostal church to provide cover for histories they preferred to obscure. But following the imprisonment of the local leader Glenn Cook, after he nearly beat a member of his brass band to death, the three new arrivals took control of a hall in the city center where local Pentecostals gathered. Rather than remain long in the Midwest, the three soon received the imprimatur of global Pentecostalism’s unofficial leader, William Seymour, to raise funds for a missionary party to South Africa. To this end, they organized and advertised a conference in late January 1908. Lehman, who claimed to have spent five years in South Africa as a missionary, made an impression by translating a woman’s glossolalic utterings as being direct communication to the assembled ‘Saints’ from God in isiZulu!14 Following the end of the conference, the group received the necessary funding for the mission. As Lake later recollected:

One day during the following February my preaching partner said to me, ‘John, how much will it cost to take our party to Johannesburg, South Africa?’ I replied, ‘Two thousand dollars’. He said, ‘If we are going to Africa in the Spring, it is time you and I were praying for the money’. I said, ‘I have been praying for the money ever since New Year. I have not heard from the Lord or anyone else concerning it’. He added, ‘Never mind, let’s pray again’. A few days later he returned from the post office and threw out on the table four $500 drafts saying, ‘John, there is the answer. Jesus has sent it. We are going to Africa’.15

The Lake party had seventeen members, including three other missionaries, wives, and children. The group paid $25 each for their third-class steamship tickets to Cape Town, a price that included free meals.16 This would have left $1575 over for the party to get established in South Africa. According to Lake, though, this was not the case, since the entire group had no more than $3.50 left over when it departed from Indianapolis!17 As a

14. Indianapolis News, 28 Jan., 1908; see also ‘Missionary Convention at Indianapolis, Indiana’, New Acts 3, 5 (1908): 15. Lehman began claiming in early 1907 that he served five years as a missionary in South Africa. His biographical accounts, like Lake’s, are full of inconsistencies. We can be sure he attended Levi Lupton’s Missionary Training School in early 1907, from where he went to Indianapolis and received the gift of tongues. See C.E. McPherson, Life of Levi R. Lupton (Alliance: by the author, 1911), 106; and New Acts 3, 4 (July/Aug 1907): 2.
15. Cited in Lindsay, John G Lake, Apostle to Africa (Dallas: Christ For the Nations, repr 1972), 22, based on Lake’s later sermons. There is no corroborating evidence regarding the $2000, although it is clear that Lake’s party did receive funds following the conference. The Pentecost 1, 1 (Aug 1908): 2, noted that ‘God opened the way for them to go, supplying their fares’. The money was probably donated by George Studd. See C.M. Robeck, The Azusa Street Mission and Revival: The Birth of the Pentecostal Movement (Nashville: Nelson, 2006), 294ff.
16. See Lindsay, John G Lake, 22; and letters from the Lake party reprinted in The Pentecost 1, 1 (Aug 1908): 3, 6.
result of this alleged penury, Lake was able to convince other passengers to buy his sister a train ticket to her home town and to pay for the party’s laundry bills. Lake was also successful in getting another large bill paid off by an unwary mark:

I knew that just as soon as we arrived at Capetown there would be dock fees and transfer accounts and hotel bills, etc, right away. Mrs. Lake and I held the matter steadfast before the Lord, and before we left the ship, while it was yet at the docks at Capetown, before the gang planks were put down, a passenger touched me on the shoulder and called me to one side. He handed me an American Express order for $200, saying, ‘Boy, the Lord told me to give you that, and He has been telling that for the last two and a half weeks.’ It paid all my expenses and landed us in Johannesburg.18

So although his party would appear to have been fairly well-financed, Lake from the start presented it as being without funds and hence in desperate need of immediate donations to continue. This was the message put through not only to fellow ship passengers, but also to the wider Pentecostal community that was contributing to the venture. It was to be a consistent theme of Lake’s South African ministry. Nor should we be surprised about Lake’s chicanery on steamship voyages. John Alexander Dowie, the original Zionist faith healer whose church had trained Lake as a religious leader, admitted under oath in court to defrauding steamship companies in order to reduce his travel expenses. Nor did he deny boasting about it to his associates either.19

LAKE’S BUSINESS CAREER EXAMINED

A major part of Lake’s religious aura was his alleged decision to abandon a lucrative business career in late 1907 in order to become a Pentecostal evangelist. This was a myth he used primarily to create legitimacy for his leadership role in various Pentecostal communities. It would also appear that these tales stirred up a sense of awe and wonder amongst credulous audiences.

Lake’s claims about his early (pre-1904) business career were not nearly as exaggerated as those he made about his 1904-7 activities. He maintained that as a young man he moved to the Chicago suburb of Harvey to found and publish the Harvey Citizen newspaper in 1891. After a few years he then returned to his hometown of Sault Ste Marie, MI in 1896, where he founded the Soo Times and developed a ‘lucrative real estate business.’ Following these successful ventures, he moved in 1901 to Dowie’s new utopia, Zion City, Illinois, where he claimed to have been in charge of the latter’s construction department.20

18. Ibid. This story was retold and embellished many times throughout Lake’s career.
20. Most available documentation on Lake can be found at the Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Springfield Missouri. Since this material has been reprinted I will refer only to published versions. See R. Liardon, John G Lake: The Complete Collection of his Life Teachings (Whitaker House, 2005), 10; Lindsay, John G Lake, 3; W. Reidt, John G Lake: A Man Without Compromise (Springfield, MO: Harrison House, 1989), 14-6; John G Lake: His Life, His Sermons, His Boldness of Faith (Ft Worth: Kenneth Copeland, 1994), 89, 269.
All these claims about his early business career are false. Instead, there is clear evidence that he spent this time as a contractor and roofer. His contracting activities were always small-scale, and receive only occasional mention in local newspapers. Lake did not bid on public contracts, and also did not advertise his services in the newspapers. Rather, he refurbished existing properties, and his real-estate activities were confined to what we would today refer to as ‘house-flipping’. As a result of buying dilapidated properties, fixing them up, and selling them, Lake made a modest income and moved regularly.21 Turning to Lake’s claims about his journalistic career, it is clear that he had no involvement in either newspaper that he claimed to have founded.22 Nor was Lake in charge of construction in Zion City, as he maintained, but was instead a mere repairman in the department. 23

Once this period working for Dowie’s construction department came to an end, Lake maintained that he moved to downtown Chicago in 1904 and quickly turned himself into a wealthy businessman. Working as a real estate investor and salesman, Lake claimed to have made $2,500 in his first day of work, and had put $100,000 in the bank by the end of 1905. This money was made on his own, as well as for the business financier Jim Hill. After this initial success, Lake was asked by a consortium of wealthy capitalists to form a trust of three large life-insurance companies and was given a salary of $50,000 a year. With this fortune and with these connections he became a millionaire, and was also able to purchase a seat on the Chicago Board of Trade.24

Of course, none of the story checks out in any way. Even Lake’s apologist biographer has noted, ‘no evidence outside of Lake’s own assertions has been found to verify Lake had any involvement with these financiers and industrialists.’25 What the record shows is that Lake never left his residence in Zion City at the time he was allegedly making his name in Chicago, and he remained in Zion City until moving to Indianapolis. Lake, though, did quit his job in Zion City, and after 1905 worked in Waukegan (a neighboring town) as a salesman for a prominent local real estate speculator, E.V. Orvis.26 In addition to hawking Orvis’s properties, Lake also sold fire and life insurance for the People’s Life Assurance Society. As an evangelist, Lake maintained that he had founded People’s Life

21. For some examples of Lake’s business activities and properties, see Sault Ste Marie News, 12 Dec. 1896; 6 Sept. 1897; and 18 Dec. 1897.
22. The Harvey Citizen was founded by the consortium that developed the new town of Harvey, not by Lake, while the Soo Times was started by George Ferris. See The Town of Harvey, Illinois: Manufacturing Suburb of Chicago aged two years (Harvey: Harvey Land Association, c. 1892); and Sault Ste Marie News, 6 Mar. 1897.
23. See remarks of Tindall and Ferguson in Zion Herald, 12 July 1907. Lake is never listed as head of construction in any of the church directories published regularly in Zion Banner from 1901-1906.
24. See Lindsay, John G Lake, 3; Reidt, John G Lake, 15; and John G Lake, 89.
25. Burpeau, God’s Showman, 57, n.112.
Assurance himself with the backing of an array of Chicago’s leading industrialists. In fact it was a small company founded by other people. So whereas Lake portrayed himself later as having worked out of fancy office buildings in Chicago, he actually operated out of modest office space in downtown Waukegan. He clearly was not wealthy. He rarely featured in the local press, although individuals such as his boss E.V. Orvis were covered constantly in the social and business sections of the local newspapers. It was also commonly known among the Zionists who their wealthiest members were, and Lake was never named among them. He was simply an ordinary, small-town insurance salesman.

LAKE’S CALL TO SOUTH AFRICA EXAMINED

From early on in his ministry, Lake developed a set of stories detailing his calling to Africa. These testimonies, which he told hundreds of times, maintain that Lake received direct communication and revelation from both God and the Holy Spirit. These stories served not only to ingratiate Lake with his audiences, but also to shield his involvement in highly unsavory affairs that occurred in Zion City in 1907 – affairs that precipitated his rapid departure for Indianapolis in October that year.

I went to Indianapolis, Indiana for a 10-day visit with Bro. Tom [Hezmalhalch] who was preaching there. Then I assisted with the services and work. While visiting the home of a Bro. Osborne… the Spirit of the Lord came upon me and God talked to me concerning Africa…. for years I had felt that one day God would send me to Africa, but never possessing what I regarded as the Divine Equipment necessary for a successful Christian worker. I had banished the thought and stifled the voice within…. God gave me at this time a spiritual vision of Africa, especially of the Zion work there – so accurate, that when I arrived in Africa 14 months later I found it correct in every detail.

Not long later after this alleged incident, Lake went to pray with “Bro. Pearse” back in Zion City:

As we knelt to pray, my soul was in such anguish I felt myself being overshadowed by the Holy Spirit, then commenced the most vivid spiritual experience of my life….Oh how he showed me His love for me. He showed me the lost world, dying souls, the sick and suffering, saying ‘all this I did for thee, what hast thou done for me?’ until my heart broke and, in anguish, I cried and told him I would go all the way with Him even unto death…. Then the

27. People’s Life was a small concern run founded by Elona G Nelson and Fremont Hoy, whereas Lake maintained it was a national organization financed by Jim Hill, Tom Lawson, Ed Harriman, and Thomas Ryan. The latter four were heavily involved in developing the suburb of Harvey Illinois in the early 1890s when Lake was a migrant worker there. Cf ibid, and Burpeau, God’s Showman, 39ff.
28. E.g. see Waukegan Daily Sun, 3 Jan. 1907, regarding Deacon Lewis.
Spirit said, Will You Go? I said, ‘Yes Lord, any place, anywhere. But, Oh Jesus, the burden must be yours, the responsibility is yours’. Then came a series of different visions of different cities came before me: first, Zion City, IL, where the Glory of God overshadowed the old Dr. Dowie tabernacle in Shiloh Park as a heavenly light….Then he showed me the downtown district of the city of Indianapolis, Indiana, and the same illumination of God’s glory…. Then, Johannesburg, South Africa, and a wonderful illumination of God’s glory lighting up the whole land….Again, I heard the voice, ‘Will you go?’ ‘Yes, yes’, I cried, ‘if you will prepare and equip me and go with me’……’Lord, I will go. I’ll go at once’.30

What these stories seek to obfuscate are the disastrous nature of Lake’s first attempt at Pentecostal ministry in Zion City in 1907 – the city from which he and his partner Tom Hezmalhalch were forced to flee from in October that year. The details can be overwhelming for those unfamiliar with early Pentecostal history, but essentially flow from the slow dissolution of Dowie’s Zionist enterprise in 1906 and 1907. In the face of their leader’s demise, the Zionists split into numerous factions. Lake’s allegiance eventually fell to Charles Parham,31 who resided intermittently in Zion City in late 1906 and who sought to convert all of Dowie’s adherents to Pentecostalism.

During the later months of 1906, Parham held a revival in Zion City that attracted Lake and a number of his friends. News of the Azusa Street revival and the new phenomenon of speaking in tongues attracted many Zionists to Parham’s banner, and many of them were soon ‘Baptized in the Holy Ghost’ as a result. Newspaper accounts of the time show that there were roughly 3-500 ‘Parhamites’, and Lake himself actually made the newspapers after he spoke in tongues for the first time in early 1907.32 Not long after this, though, Parham left Zion City for good when the municipal water tower collapsed on top of his revival tent.33

Despite this hasty departure, Parham’s followers continued to pay him tithes and to show considerable resiliency in the face of opposition they encountered in Zion City. Tom Hezmalhalch, who arrived in Zion from Azusa Street not long after Parham’s departure, seems to have played a considerable role in stabilizing the group. He was able to get William Seymour to visit Zion City and to otherwise keep the group connected to the burgeoning Pentecostal movement.34 Lake himself rose in prominence within the group.

32. Waukegan Daily Sun 3 Jan. 1907.
34. Most information on this group comes from the frequent denunciatory accounts in the weekly edition of the Zion Herald 4 May 1907ff.
over the course of the year, and by summer was leading services and was generally considered (along with Hezmalhalch) as the unofficial leader.

Lake’s increasing prominence within the Parhamite sect coincided with the group’s apparent descent into a collective frenzy of insanity, demon possession, and murder. The trigger for the Parhamites’ implosion was the July arrest of Charles Parham in Texas for soliciting sex from a teenager in Texas. These charges appeared to confirm rumors about his pederastic tendencies that had been circulating in the Midwest, and which would ruin his reputation in Pentecostal quarters thereafter. Parham’s fall, which came in the aftermath of John Alexander Dowie’s downfall, meant that his followers had seen two cherished leaders disgraced in quick succession. In the meantime, Zion City’s economy was struggling and most of the Parhamites were in financial straits. To make matters worse, their biggest enemy, W.G. Voliva, was tightening his grip on Zion City’s theocratic structures. In the face of these setbacks, the Parhamites came to view the source of their problems as diabolical. In the weeks following Parham’s downfall, nine (seven women and two boys) Parhamites would be possessed by demons.

As the frenzy continued the Parhamites met practically daily for long, emotional services: ‘insanity becomes common, ravings of lunatics are heard on every hand, adulteries are committed’. Both the Parhamites and the Voliva faction had been preaching about the imminence of the ‘end times’ since early in 1907, which undoubtedly contributed to a heightened atmosphere. Meanwhile, Voliva and the mainstream church members in Zion City were relentless in their attacks on the Parhamites, calling them ‘intoxicated’, ‘demon-inspired’, ‘a fanatical set’, ‘an abomination’, and a ‘barbarian horde’. Denunciations of the new ‘Tongues Church’ were a regular feature of sermons and newspapers. Meanwhile lurid descriptions of the Parhamite services, which featured excessive ‘emotionalism’, including dancing, jumping, waving hands, ‘insane ecstasies’, shouting, rolling on the floor, spasms, trances, and visions, were accompanied by warnings from Voliva that this behavior ‘would lead to demon-possession.

To deal with these possessions the Parhamites fell back on Dowie’s teachings, which maintained that insanity and mental illness were caused by Satanic forces that had invaded and taken control of an individual’s body and mind. They also relied on Dowie’s

old exorcism techniques, which relied on prayer to invoke God’s assistance, combined with the use of physical force to expel the demon from the body. The possessed individual would be tied up and restrained, while the healer would then use physical force to twist the demon slowly out of the body, limb by limb. These attempts could last for days at a time, and typically the afflicted individual would also be denied all food, water, and comforts in order to induce the demons to exit the body.39

These exorcism methods ultimately led to the deaths of two sect members. Hezmalhalch and Lake did not conduct the sessions themselves, apparently because they felt they lacked the ‘necessary spiritual power’. Referring back to this period several years later, Lake recalled that he and Hezmalhalch ‘had been praying for greater power for the healing of the sick and the casting out of demons at this time’.40 Instead, Harold Mitchell, who was a regular attendee of their services,41 had a vision ‘in which Mitchell was ordered to quit work and devote his time to casting out demons from the sick’.42 Of the nine cases in which Mitchell and the Parhamites took on, there were two fatalities, and indications of others. Because the Zion City undertaker was a Parhamite, many of the corpses were not officially registered with the State coroner. Many unnatural deaths did not get reported as such – as had been going on throughout Dowie’s tenure in Zion City.43

In the case that brought the Parhamites to national attention, Mitchell and four others held down a possessed, bed-ridden woman named Letitia Greenhaulgh in her bedroom against her husband’s wishes, and during a marathon exorcism eventually killed her after breaking her arms, legs, and neck while trying to force the demon out of her.44 Over the next few days, lurid photographs of both the accused and of Greenhaulgh’s mangled corpse were published in newspapers across America and evoked extensive outrage.

Because Lake and Hezmalhalch were not directly involved in the exorcisms, they were not prosecuted by the authorities. But neither of the two showed misgivings about what had occurred. Lake himself remained obsessed with demon-possession in months following the Greenhaulgh tragedy. Immediately after decamping from Zion City he went on a long fast. According to his own testimony on the fifth day the voice of God

39. See the string of newspaper stories in Chicago Tribune following the botched exorcism of Millie Logan in May 1900. ‘Bound at a Dowie Home’, 24 May 1900; ‘Followers Hit At Dowie’, 3 June 1900; and ‘State Beards Dowie in Zion’, 9 June 1900. For Dowie’s version of events see Leaves of Healing 7 (1900): 238-9.
40. Blake, Writings From Africa, 148.
41. Zion Herald 27 Sept. 1907.
42. Indianapolis News 20 Sept. 1907.
43. Indianapolis News 22 Sept. 1907. This was done to minimize public knowledge of the recurrent and catastrophic failures of the faith healing process.
44. See ‘Tortured in Rites of Fanatics: Dies’, Chicago Tribune 21 Sept. 1907. This story followed in all the major American newspapers for the next three days.
came to him and told him that ‘from thenceforth you shall cast out demons’. Soon after this, Lake claims to have cast out a demon successfully in Indianapolis. In early 1908 he was boasting to newspaper reporters about his power to ‘heal the insane’, maintaining that ‘insanity is a kind of demon—a “nutty” demon’.

If the state authorities did not hold Lake and Hezmalhalch responsible for the exorcism deaths, the local population of the Zion City area did. W.G. Voliva, the town’s theocratic mayor, demanded that all the ‘Wizards and Necromancers of Hell’ be ‘driven from Zion’. Further declaring that ‘Parham, Tom [Hezmalhalch], Lake’ were ‘responsible in a greater or less degree’ for the Greenhaulgh outrage, Voliva declared that ‘the time has now come for these religious fanatics to cease forever proclaiming their hellish doctrine and to forever quit our town….they have put themselves outside the rights of citizens. They are enemies of sane mankind, though claiming to be religious….They must move on.’ Secular voices were no less harsh: ‘it is too much to expect Lake County people to stand any more for the Parhamites of Zion City, which these ferocious fanatics are said to belong to, and the entire sect should be driven out of Zion City and out of Illinois without mercy’.

In the face of these threats Lake and Hezmalhalch moved quickly to Indianapolis, while the rest of the Parhamites scattered too. Within a month, newspapers reported that ‘you cannot find a Parhamite in town anymore’. In order to explain his lack of funds, Lake then quickly invented his story about having abandoned his business career and giving all his money away to the church.

In the light of these events it is clear that Lake and Hezmalhalch did not leave Zion City in response to divine calling. Instead, they ran away to escape popular justice. Why then did they choose to organize a mission to South Africa? We can infer the impending departure of the Reverend William Bryant from South Africa enabled the Lake party to replace him as leader of the South African Zionists. Bryant, who had been sent to South Africa in 1904, had quickly developed Dowie’s biggest foreign congregation there.

47. *Chicago Tribune* 23 Sept. 1907.
50. Lake’s final act before leaving was to go to court on 7 Oct. to recover money owed to him by another individual. This is a far cry from giving away his million dollar fortune as he later alleged he was doing at this time! See *Waukegan Daily Sun* 8 Oct. 1907.
51. *Zion Herald* 1 Nov. 1907.
52. That he began using the story in Indianapolis is clear in *The Pentecost* 1, 1 (August 1908): 4.
Although most members of the church were impoverished African peasants, Bryant had also organized many successful tithes-paying white congregations on the Rand, including Krugersdorp, which was called ‘one of the most profitable centers’ in the entire church.54 During the period from 1904 on Bryant’s region reported far more baptisms than any other section of the church, and was clearly the most successful.55 Following Dowie’s demise, Bryant had emerged as a minor contender to the Zionist leadership, but was eclipsed by his hated rival W. G. Voliva. This defeat prompted Bryant to pull his South African congregations out of the Zionist church.56 But rather than remaining in South Africa, Bryant decided to relocate to California. As a result an existing, profitable, leaderless organization was thus ripe for the taking.

Lake and Bryant had had significant dealings in the past as mid-level officials in Dowie’s church,57 so it is likely that the two orchestrated a hand-over. In any case, Lake clearly corresponded with various people prior to his arrival in South Africa, and his family was given a house to live in rent-free on the day of his arrival. He and Hezmalhalch also seamlessly took control over Bryant’s former members, brought them into the newly-formed AFM in May, and were financially supported by them from the beginning. Everything points to a carefully-orchestrated move to South Africa, rather than an impulsive, divinely-inspired one.58

SOME SOUTH AFRICAN RELIGIOUS SCAMS

Lake and the early AFM leadership utilized a whole host of forms of religious fraud to attract tithes-paying members to their church.

It would appear that Lake learned two of these methods directly from Dowie himself, as he and other members of his family were engaged to perform them. On the one hand,
Lake and members of his family often appeared at Zionist services and provided false testimonies about miraculous faith healing cures that Dowie had performed. For instance, in 1900 Lake traveled to Chicago from Michigan and testified that his sister Maggie had developed ‘five cancers’, all of which eminent surgeons in Detroit were unable to treat. As Maggie approached death’s door, Lake took her to Chicago, where Dowie ‘utterly healed’ her in an instant by laying hands on her. Several days after this cure had been affected, Lake was able to insert his hands into his sister’s chest and extract the black tumors, which had become detached from the body!59 Another fraud the Lakes aided Dowie in perpetrated was to help him stage ‘distant miracles’. In this con, a dire message about the rapidly deteriorating health of someone would reach Dowie at a religious gathering. The Lakes and other placemen in the audience would pretend to have knowledge of the allegedly sick person, and would provide further details to the audience. Dowie would then lead a group prayer, and by the time the service had concluded a telegram or phone call would be received of a miraculous healing.60 Written records of these scams show that Lake himself, a brother, two sisters, three sons, and his wife, were all rescued from death’s door (some on multiple occasions) in a period of eight years!

Given this history with Dowie, it is not surprising that during their first year in South Africa the Lake party relied heavily on religious fraud in its services. Lake and Lehman engaged in the vast majority of the trickery, while Hezmalhalch tended to deliver sermons or to enunciate on doctrinal issues. In fact the early AFM meetings were practically obliged to use religious fraud, given that their advertising broadsheets promised audiences ‘Baptism of the Holy Ghost with Signs Following’, along with ‘Miraculous Healings’. Hence, they had no choice but to provide ‘signs and wonders’ with each performance.61 Although it can be conceded that there were some often-times spectacular placebo cures of individuals suffering from psychosomatic illnesses, nevertheless most of the ‘signs and wonders’ were staged.

The source of many acts of fraud was Dowie. Just as the latter had done, Lake decorated the entire altar of his Johannesburg tabernacle with an array of old crutches and therapeutic devices allegedly discarded by the formerly disabled.62 Thus the allegedly crippled were routinely brought in and made to walk again through the laying of hands. Variations on the theme included instant on-stage cures for the ‘deaf’ and ‘blind’.63 ‘Distant miracles’ were another staple, and at his Johannesburg performances Lake was able to cure women as far away as England and Iowa, and also through prayer enabled the barren Queen

60. See *Leaves of Healing* 3 (1896): 100, involving Maggie Lake Otto.
63. See *Latter Rain Evangel* (Nov. 1908), n.p.; *John G Lake*, 293-5; Blake, *Writings From Africa*, 40.
of the Netherlands to have children again. The onstage extraction of ‘tumors’ and ‘cancers’ was made use of frequently, and bottles containing these tissues were often on display during services. Other common frauds included supernatural showdowns with ‘hypnotists’ or others possessing diabolical powers. After a short, dramatic stand-off these opponents of God were usually rendered catatonic. Fake exorcisms were also employed. Another trick that Lake and Lehman employed was the ‘tongues con’, in which placemen in the audience claiming to be from distant lands would interpret glossalalia as direct communication from the Almighty for the benefit of the audience.

To sum up in the words of one AFM historian, ‘one realizes that most probably many of the healings and miracles reported by the early workers in the AFM could be exaggerated and could not stand up to scientific evaluation and testing’.

Raising the dead was another means by which Lake claimed to have demonstrated his spiritual power, a power that many of his African successors also claimed to have. Lake claimed to have orchestrated five resurrections in South Africa, including that of Maggie Truter in July 1909. Lake often brought the latter, the stepdaughter of one of his lieutenants, onstage in his services. Here is Lake’s version: ‘Maggie…was violently ill for a long time. After several weeks’ illness, one night the death rattle came into her throat. She kissed her parents and brother goodbye.’ At this point Truter, a trained singer, sang a verse of a pentecostal hymn, and then

her breathing apparently stopped, and so far as human judgment went, she seemed to be dead, and I have seen many die. As this went on, a strange operation was going on in my spirit. I seemed to see her leave the body and rise upward. She kept getting further away, very slowly. It seemed to me that I was holding her spirit by a grip of my spirit. The Holy Ghost was upon me in power.

After a time, I realized she was getting out of my control. I roused myself, prayed with more fervency, and, finally, with command, I said, ‘You are not going away. In the Name of Jesus Christ come back’….Then, in a little while, she was breathing easily. God had heard. The

66. E.g. Lindsay, John G Lake, 28, 77ff; Latter Rain Evangel (Nov. 1908); ibid, 6.
67. For early use of the tongues con, see Lindsay, John G Lake, 27: John G Lake, 244-5; Confidence (Mar. 1909): 74-5; Apostolic Faith 11 (Nov.-Dec. 1909): 4. This trick was probably learned from Charles Parham, who originated it. See Apostolic Faith 1, 7 (Dec. 1905): 4.
70. Truter was the step-daughter of a defrocked minister, R.H. Van De Wall, who joined Lake early on, became a key ally, and served as the secretary of the AFM. See Confidence 2, 2 (Feb 1909): 5.
blood-availed Christ was conqueror. On examination, we found that she had apparently been dead 35 minutes.  

Lake’s version of events, and the version which he would have Truter testify to, are contradicted by secular newspaper reports published immediately after this incident. The Rand Daily Mail, which had run occasional articles in the past casting doubt on the veracity of Lake’s miracles, printed Truter’s mother’s account of events the day following this healing. Mrs Truter was adamant that a faith healing had occurred, but Lake does not seem to have been involved:

Yes, her daughter had been in terrible agony, and they had quite expected that she was ‘going home’. But they had prayed, and the sick girl had prayed. ‘If the words of Jesus is true,’ the girl had said, ‘I will get well.’ And shortly the crisis had passed, leaving the girl much better …. ‘My daughter’s wish’ [according to Mrs Van de Wall] has always been to ‘go home’. But when she saw my grief today at the thought that she was leaving me she prayed for herself. It was then that she recovered. It was a miracle.

Even though an alternative version of events had been published in a newspaper, Lake nevertheless persisted in using the story of Truter’s resurrection in his services and fund raising campaigns. Lake also claimed to have, along with his protégé Elias Letwaba, raised four people back to life on an expedition to the Waterberg in May/June 1909. These and other miraculous healings were first publicized in late 1909 on a fund-raisng trip in California that netted some $3000 in contributions (and were also testified to frequently thereafter). A perfunctory official investigation of these claims, launched due to the skepticism of Lake and Letwaba’s landlord, could not verify any of the claims. Letwaba insisted to officials that the resurrections had in fact occurred, although he conceded that

71. Lake’s diary entry, Johannesburg, 6 Dec. 1910, in Blake, Writings From Africa, 160-1. Lake’s ‘diary’ appears to have existed in part for him to invent various miracles and events that he could use in sermons and publications.

72. ‘Choosing to Die: Spread of ‘Faith Healing’—Rand Girl’s Sad Story’, Rand Daily Mail 7 July 1909. Mrs v. d. Wall had testified at AFM gatherings to have “been cured instantly of heart disease after eleven doctors had treated her unsuccessfully.” Her husband, meanwhile, was Lake’s closest supporter, and was later accused of irregularities in court in sworn testimony, ‘Bother Among the Brethren: Apostolic Mission Squabble’, Rand Daily Mail 24 Nov. 1910. Maggie Truter would appear to have been pressured to testify about her “resurrection” by Lake and her parents—in the same manner that Lake and his family had provided false testimonies for Dowie.

one of them had happened “twelve years earlier”. All these ‘resurrections’ would appear to be very dubious.

A final technique that Lake and his acolytes used in South Africa was the ‘precognition’ scam, which proved particularly successful in rural areas. An episode from May 1910 is a good example:

They felt they should go to Basutoland….The day before they arrived the mother of a native chief had a remarkable dream in which the Lord told her that the next day at 12 o’clock some white men would come of a different religion from theirs, and that they were to receive them in the name of the Lord and that through them the people would be greatly blessed. She went around all over the Kraal and told the people in the morning what the Lord had shown her. Her son was the chief and she also told him. The mother herself had a great internal tumor.

At 12 o’clock precisely, the brethren came, as the Lord had saith, and when they came they found the whole Kraal in excitement of expectation awaiting them. The woman was healed. The chief gave his heart to God….Brother Van Schele told me this morning that so far as he was able to know the entire Kraal was saved.

‘Precognition’ was thus a simple tactic that only required the assistance of a seemingly-unrelated person to go ahead and make a prediction about the imminent arrival of strangers with unusual powers. In this case, it was followed with the standard ‘tumor extraction’ technique to apparently great effect.

Lake trained at least three influential African preachers in this wide range of methods: Edward Lion, Isaiah Shembe, and Elias Letwaba. The first two formed the Zion Apostolic Faith Mission and the Nazarite Churches respectively (the second and third largest Zionist congregations), with Lion himself being the mentor of Engenas Lekganyane, founder of the largest Zionist group, the Zion Christian Church. Letwaba, who remained in the

74. Transvaal Archives Depot SNA 472, NA 2441/10, Hook to Godley 29 July 1910. There are sharply varying accounts of the AFM mission to the Waterberg. The Rand Daily Mail 7 July 1909 describes a fiasco, noting that three of the six person party had died of malaria. This version is corroborated by Lake’s initial description of the trip, Confidence 2, 8 (Aug. 1909): 185, in which he blames the mission’s failure on lack of funds and transport. The official enquiry also shows that few healings took place. Lake’s later published versions describe a multitude of healings so amazing that Prime Minister Louis Botha was moved to send a hundred ox-wagons to support the effort. See Ibid., and Lindsay, John G Lake, 35-6.


AFM fold, nevertheless was particularly influential since he founded and ran the Patmos Bible School for over twenty years. This was the only African-run seminary in South Africa. ‘And so Letwaba as no other man carried on the great work started by John G Lake in Africa. It is still going on today’.77

ACCUSATIONS MADE VERSUS LAKE 1909-10

After a barnstorming first year in South Africa, Lake began to be attacked by a number of less prominent leaders. These accusations, from which Lake was eventually exonerated by his hand-picked AFM leadership, led to the secession of many white Pentecostals from the AFM.78 By the same token, they also allowed Lake to tighten his grip on the organization. So although he successfully quashed his opponents, it appears that their accusations bore considerable merit.

The major source of dissension was the arrival of new Pentecostal missionaries from America and England. Lake and his party’s propaganda in Pentecostal publications (always accompanied by desperate pleas for money) had made it appear that incredible events were occurring in South Africa. The editor of Confidence, who regularly published Lake’s letters and solicited donations for him, noted that ‘in Africa the scenes and salvation have been a repetition of the Book of Acts, only possibly on a larger scale. Whole sections of the regions of Johannesburg and Pretoria, South Africa, accepted this Gospel of the Kingdom, this original Gospel with signs following’.79 “Meanwhile, the leading Pentecostal J. Roswell Flower, a fundraiser for Lake who had met him in Indianapolis, wrote that ‘reports from the great revival in South Africa fill us with awe; there has been nothing like it during all the gospel age for healings and miracles’.80 Unfortunately for the newly-arrived missionaries, they found on arrival that the Pentecostal campaign was far more mundane than had been portrayed. In the face of this disappointment, ‘very disquieting reports’ began to make their way back to Europe and America about Lake.81

Although none of these many letters were published nor are still extant, the broad nature of the accusations they made is clear. The major charge was that Lake was misappropriating the AFM’s funds. Pentecostals in the United States and elsewhere had donated considerable sums to the AFM, but only Lake and his party on the Rand had access to cash. The AFM preachers and organizers in the rural areas, who led large

77. Lindsay, John G Lake, 52. See also W. Burton, When God Makes a Pastor (Clapham Park: Victory Press, 1934).
78. See Burpeau, God’s Showman, 120-4
African congregations, received little to no funding from Lake at all.82 Given Lake’s penchant for deceit, along with the fact that he had his brother-in-law installed as AFM treasurer, there are grounds for believing that Lake and his party made use of the vast majority of available funding for their own benefit.

Other accusations made against Lake were that he was acting dictatorially, and strove to be ‘a second Dowie’. Furthermore, he had completely exaggerated the scope and nature of the Pentecostal revival in South Africa to the international community. These allegations, too, would appear to have merit. More disturbingly, there were also accusations that Lake was actually a con man, ‘an untrue man’,83 who used occult powers in his activities. His close friendships with spiritualist con men and his claimed communication with his dead wife via séance created rumblings in AFM circles. His conduct with his young fiancé following his wife’s death also created problems. When his attempts at curing her malaria through faith healing failed, he blamed her death on members of his congregation who ‘had a bad spirit towards her’.84 He was also accused of conducting adulterous relationships with women in his congregation.85 As Lake himself put it, ‘they say I am possessed of a devil, that’s how people are saved and healed….They now openly say it is the devil who heals’.86

If Lake’s handpicked AFM leadership exonerated him of all the accusations, nevertheless he lost significant support as a result. Practically all the international Pentecostal newspapers stopped printing stories from him, and instead promoted the work of other missionaries. Many white members left to join other new Pentecostal churches. Meanwhile, Lake forced Hezmalhalch and Lehman out of the AFM. With his grip on the organization stronger, he began to focus more on developing African preachers such as Letwaba and Lion – both of whom would be central to the spread of ‘faith healing’ and Zionist Christianity alike amongst Black South Africans.

CONCLUSION
Analysis of an array of secular and religious sources, much of it not used by religious

82. See ‘South Africa and Brother Lake’, *Upper Room* 2, 3 (Nov. 1910): 1; reprinted in Blake, *Writings From Africa*, 131-5. For instance, P.L. Le Roux, the AFM’s most successful missionary, was allotted £5 a month for his work in Wakkerstroom. Few others received anything. Lake had been given $2200 in one large donation in 1909, and also raised $3000 in the United States later. Most of this money came from George Studd of the Upper Room Mission in Los Angeles, a branch of Azusa Street. This was in addition to local and international offerings.


84. Ibid.


86. Ibid, 173.
historians before, makes it evident that John G Lake was a religious fraud. He used
deception to as a means to inveigle himself and his associates at the head of the South
African Pentecostal/Zionist enterprise. Once there he used a host of unsavory techniques
to attract converts. Moreover, he trained a number of associates to use these techniques
and further spread the movement. Zionism, then, started off as a ‘racket’. The late
Christopher Hitchens has eloquently stated about what we need to consider next: ‘this
story raises some very absorbing questions, concerning what happens when a plain racket
turns into a serious religion before our eyes.’87

REFERENCES

____. African Reformation: African Initiated Christianity in the 20th Century (Trenton,
Isaiah Shembe Volume I: History and Traditions Centered on Ekuphakameni and
Mount Nhlangakazi. Translated by H-J. Becken (Lewiston: Edwin Mellen, 1994).
Blake, C., ed, John G. Lake’s Writings From Africa (Dallas: Xulon Press, 2005).
Burpeau, K. God’s Showman: A Historical Study of John G Lake and South Africa/
American Pentecostalism (Oslo: Refleks, 2004).
Chandomba, L. The History of Apostolic Faith Mission and other Pentecostal Missions
in South Africa (Milton Keynes: AuthorHouse, 2007).
Comaroff, J. Body of Power, Spirit of Resistance: The Culture and History of a South
Cook, P.L. Zion City Illinois: Twentieth Century Utopia (Syracuse: Syracuse University
John G Lake: His Life, His Sermons, His Boldness of Faith (Ft Worth: Kenneth Copeland,
1994).
‘A Glorious Year’s Work For God and Zion in South Africa’, Leaves of Healing, 15 (July
1905): 481-94.
Goff, J.R. Fields White Unto Harvest: Charles F. Parham and the Missionary Origins of
Pentecostalism (Little Rock: University of Arkansas Press, 1988).
Hexham, I., and G.C. Oosthuizen, eds, The Story of Isaiah Shembe Volume I: History and
Traditions Centered on Ekuphakameni and Mount Nhlangakazi. Translated by
H-J. Becken (Lewiston: Edwin Mellen, 1994).
Hitchens, C. God is Not Great: How Religion Poisons Everything (New York: Twelve,
2009).

87. C. Hitchens, God Is Not Great: How Religion Poisons Everything (New York: Twelve, 2009),
165.
Lindsay, G. John G Lake, Apostle to Africa (Dallas: Christ For the Nations, repr 1972).
Oosthuizen, C.G. The Birth of Christian Zionism in South Africa (Kwa-Dlangezwa: University of Zululand, 1987).
The Town of Harvey, Illinois: Manufacturing Suburb of Chicago aged two years (Harvey: Harvey Land Association, c. 1892).

Newspapers and Websites
http://endtimespropheticwords.wordpress.com/category/curry-blake/
http://www.letusreason.org/Popteach45.htm
Chicago Chronicle 21 Jan. 1907.
Chicago Inter-Ocean, 21 Feb. 1907.
Chicago Tribune 24 May 1900; 3 June 1900; 9 June 1900; 23 Feb. 1907; 21 Sept. 1907; 23 Sept. 1907.
*Latter Rain Evangel* (Nov. 1908), n.p.
*The Pentecost* 1, 1 (Aug. 1908): 4-6-7; 1, 2 (Sept. 1908): 2; 1, 4 (1908), n.p.
*Zion Banner* 1901-6.
*Zion Herald* 4 May 1907; 12 July 1907; 2 Aug. 1907; 20 Sept. 1907; 27 Sept. 1907; 1 Nov. 1907.